



City and County of Swansea

Notice of Meeting

You are invited to attend a Meeting of the

Economy, Environment & Infrastructure Policy Development Committee

At: Remotely via Microsoft Teams

On: Thursday, 15 July 2021

Time: 2.00 pm

Chair: Councillor Cyril Anderson

Membership:

Councillors: J E Burtonshaw, P Downing, P R Hood-Williams, P K Jones, M A Langstone, W G Lewis, P Lloyd, P M Matthews and T M White

Watch Online: [//bit.ly/3ydzOGQ](https://bit.ly/3ydzOGQ)

Agenda

	Page No.
1 Apologies for Absence.	
2 Disclosures of Personal & Prejudicial Interests. www.swansea.gov.uk/disclosureofinterests	
3 Minutes. To approve and sign the Minutes of the previous meeting(s) as a correct record.	1 - 2
4 Siting of Bus Stops.	3 - 6
5 Traffic Calming.	7 - 14
6 Work Plan 2021 - 2022.	15 - 16

Next Meeting: Thursday, 16 September 2021 at 2.00 pm

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads 'Huw Evans'.

Huw Evans

Head of Democratic Services

Friday, 9 July 2021

Contact: Democratic Services - Tel: (01792) 636923

Agenda Item 3



City and County of Swansea

Minutes of the **Economy, Environment & Infrastructure Policy Development Committee**

Remotely via Microsoft Teams

Thursday, 17 June 2021 at 2.00 pm

Present: Councillor C Anderson (Chair) Presided

Councillor(s)

J E Burtonshaw
M Jones
P Lloyd

Councillor(s)

P Downing
M A Langstone
P M Matthews

Councillor(s)

P R Hood-Williams
W G Lewis
T M White

Officer(s)

Scott Dummett
Martin Nicholls
Samantha Woon

Senior Lawyer
Director of Place
Democratic Services Officer

Also Present:

Councillor R Francis-Davies – Cabinet Member for Investment, Regeneration and Tourism.

4 **Disclosures of Personal & Prejudicial Interests.**

In accordance with the Code of Conduct adopted by the City and County of Swansea, no interests were declared.

5 **Minutes.**

Resolved that the Minutes of the Economy and Infrastructure Policy Development Committee held on 22 April and 20 May, 2021, be approved as correct records.

6 **Annual Report & Proposed Work Plan 2021-2022.**

The Director of Place presented the Annual Report and proposed Work Plan for 2021-2022.

Members' noted the topics that had been covered during the previous Municipal Year.

Members' debated the proposed work plan items and asked questions of the Director of Place who responded accordingly.

The Cabinet Member for Investment, Regeneration and Tourism, suggested that the Committee examine the quality and consistency of grass cutting across the City and County of Swansea.

Resolved that:

1. The report be **noted**.
2. The Director of Place update Members' regarding the content of the Management of Maintenance of Open Spaces (Biodiversity) on-line survey prior to approval.
3. Climate Change Strategy be included in the work plan.
4. Future City Centre Workforce to include the City Deal Talent & Skills Regional Arrangement.
5. Traffic calming to be included in the speed hump topic.
6. Street Lighting be included.
7. The Director of Place populate the work plan with suggested dates and prioritise topics into those matters which can be dealt with on shorter and longer timescales.

The meeting ended at 2.30 pm

Chair

Agenda Item 4



Report of the Director of Place

Economy, Environment and Infrastructure Policy Development Committee

15 July 2021

Bus Stops and Shelters

Purpose:	The report describes how bus shelters across the Swansea area are provided and maintained.
Report Author:	Catherine Swain
Finance Officer:	Paul Roach
Legal Officer:	Debbie Smith
Access to Services Officer:	Rhian Millar
For Information	

1. Background

- 1.1 The majority of bus services in the Swansea area are provided by private bus companies who operate over 80% of the services without funding from the Council. The bus companies determine which services they wish to operate, where, when and the fares they charge. The Council subsidises some services to supplement these and fill gaps in the bus network where a social need for a bus service has been identified.
- 1.2 Bus stops are provided by the Council which provide an identifiable point where passengers can wait for bus services along bus routes. The Council is responsible for maintaining bus stops and shelters which are used by operators of commercial and subsidised services.

2. Details of bus stops and shelters

- 2.1 There are currently 1627 bus stops across the Swansea area. Of these 685 are bus stop poles with flags, 360 stops are unmarked and operate on a 'hail and ride' basis, and there are 582 stops with bus shelters.

- 2.2 There are 414 sites where raised kerbing has been installed to facilitate easier access to buses for passengers with mobility problems or those with pushchairs/ buggies.
- 2.3 Of the 582 shelters, 470 are owned by the Council and 112 are owned by Clearchannel . There are electronic passenger information screens in 23 bus shelters.
- 2.4 The shelters owned by Clearchannel have been in situ since 1994 and were provided as part of an Agreement with the former Swansea City Council. Clearchannel provided the shelters at no cost to the Council in exchange for exclusive advertising rights at these locations. The Agreement was for an initial period of 20 years and included the cleaning and maintenance of the shelters.
- 2.5 The contract was retendered in 2013 and at that time no compliant tenders were received. The contract with Clearchannel has therefore been extended to allow procurement options to be reviewed. A tendering exercise for a new provider for advertising bus shelters has now been completed and it is anticipated that the installation of the new shelters will start later this year.
- 2.6 The bus shelters owned by the Council vary in design and construction. Some are made of steel and glass or Perspex and others are block or brick. The condition of the shelters also varies significantly. Some shelters are over 40 years old and in poor condition whilst others have been installed within the past few years using Welsh Government Transport Grant funding, are of modern design and in excellent condition.
- 2.7 The Council is responsible for the cleaning and maintenance of the shelters that it owns. The budget for this is £15,000 per year and therefore cleaning is done infrequently and maintenance is carried out on an ad hoc, reactive basis. As a result, the condition of the bus shelter stock is gradually deteriorating. Where bus shelters become structurally unsound then they are removed.

3. Bus stop locations

- 3.1 The majority of bus stops have been in position for many decades. They are mainly located on current bus routes, but there are a few in areas where bus services no longer operate.
- 3.2 Where requests are received for new stops, consultation takes place with the Ward Councillor, bus companies and residents in the vicinity of the proposed location. The site is assessed to ensure that there is sufficient footway width to accommodate a bus stop pole or a shelter whilst allowing the statutory width for wheelchair passage. A road

safety audit is carried out to ensure that appropriate visibility for driveways and junctions in the vicinity and for pedestrians and passing traffic is maintained.

- 3.3 The relocation or removal of existing bus stops, for example where there are issues of persistent antisocial behaviour, is also undertaken in conjunction with bus companies and local Councillors.
- 3.4 There is no allocated budget for the provision of bus shelters at additional sites. New shelters provided in recent years have been funded as part of Local Transport Network or Active Travel schemes using Welsh Government Transport Grant funds. Other shelters have been funded from S106 allocations linked to housing developments and some by Councillors using their ward community budgets. Where Councillors choose to purchase shelters for new sites then this also includes the cost of on-going maintenance.

4. Integrated Assessment Implications

- 4.1 The Council is subject to the Equality Act (Public Sector Equality Duty and the socio-economic duty), the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 and the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure, and must in the exercise of their functions, have due regard to the need to:
 - Eliminate unlawful discrimination, harassment and victimisation and other conduct prohibited by the Acts.
 - Advance equality of opportunity between people who share a protected characteristic and those who do not.
 - Foster good relations between people who share a protected characteristic and those who do not.
 - Deliver better outcomes for those people who experience socio-economic disadvantage
 - Consider opportunities for people to use the Welsh language
 - Treat the Welsh language no less favourably than English.
 - Ensure that the needs of the present are met without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs.
- 4.1.1 The Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2005 mandates that public bodies in Wales must carry out sustainable development. Sustainable development means the process of improving the economic, social, environmental and cultural well-being of Wales by taking action, in accordance with the sustainable development principle, aimed at achieving the 'well-being goals'.
- 4.1.2 Our Integrated Impact Assessment (IIA) process ensures we have paid due regard to the above. It also takes into account other key issues and priorities, such as poverty and social exclusion, community

cohesion, carers, the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC) and Welsh language.

- 4.3 As this is a report for information, an IIA Screening Form has not been completed.

5. Legal Implications

- 5.1 There are no legal implications from this report.

6. Financial Implications

- 6.1 There are no financial implications from this report.

Background papers: None

Agenda Item 5



Report of the Director of Place

Economy, Environment and Infrastructure Policy Development Committee

15 July 2021

Traffic Calming – An overview

Purpose:	To provide a brief overview on the background and issues for consideration associated with the introduction of Traffic Calming works
Report Author:	Alan Ferris
Finance Officer:	Paul Roach
Legal Officer:	Debbie Smith
Access to Services Officer:	Rhian Millar
FOR INFORMATION	

1. Introduction

- 1.1 This report has been prepared to assist members in assessing the range of traffic calming options that are available in addressing road safety concerns.
- 1.2 It should be noted that this is an overview of the ambition of undertaking such works, the processes involved together with an outline of a number of solutions which can be implemented. Where schemes are being considered via community budgets or other sources of funding the Traffic Management Team can provide more detailed advice on the factors which need to be considered in developing such a scheme.

2. Traffic calming - considerations

- 2.1 Traffic calming is a tool used predominantly in response to concerns over a pattern of collisions where speed is at the least seen as being a

contributory factor; or in situations where recorded traffic speeds are a significant cause for concern. Although the enforcement of the speed limit is the responsibility of the police, high demand for enforcement often stretches available resource, limiting the opportunity for effective speed limit enforcement activities.

2.2 Traffic calming can also be a key driver in encouraging the use of public transport, cycling and walking, and discouragement of using the car for non essential journeys. Traffic calming has a significant role to play in achieving these objectives by improving the safety of vulnerable road users. This supports a raft of Welsh Government policies most particularly it assists in supporting the aspirations of the Active Travel (Wales) Act 2013.

2.3 Whilst traffic calming measures have improved safety overall, they have not always been universally popular. Some of the issues and limitations that have been exposed include:

- Buses – journey times can increase, as can passenger discomfort and concerns about passenger safety (especially when humps or cushions are placed at or near bus stops). There are also some concerns about increased wear to buses.
- Emergency services – physical speed-reducing measures can adversely affect the response times of emergency services vehicles. This is particularly relevant to fire and ambulance services. All services should plan routes in traffic-calmed areas with the local highway authority, so that the fastest routes are used, rather than the shortest. Road traffic cushions are designed to provide minimal disturbance to large emergency response vehicles such as fire engines and ambulances.
- Public opinion – can be very supportive, but in some cases resistance from residents has required removal of measures. Key factors are the priority of road safety on the local agenda, the quality of the scheme design and the approach adopted for the consultation process.
- Cyclists – can find some traffic calming measures uncomfortable, particularly where measures have high upstands. Design of measures needs to take cyclists into account and, where feasible, provide encouragement in the form of cycle bypasses.
- Motorcyclists – can find some measures difficult to negotiate.
- Equestrians – reported to find that some measures, such as pinch points, have an adverse effect on their safety.
- Disabled or older occupants of vehicles, particularly those with pre-existing back conditions, can find measures, specifically but not

exclusively vertical deflections, more uncomfortable and more difficult to negotiate than more able bodied persons do.

- Local environment – traffic calming measures change speed profiles and in some circumstances may lead to higher emission and noise levels. Care needs to be taken to minimise any such adverse effects by encouraging smooth driving patterns, this is generally achieved by ensuring that any features are located at a spacing which discourages acceleration and deceleration patterns, which lead to increased noise and emissions.
- General Maintenance – The introduction of traffic calming on the existing highway in many cases leads to increased stresses on the existing surface. This in turn decreases the lifespan of the highway in proximity to features, designed to manage the flow of traffic and reduce collisions. In addition, alteration to the flow of water may affect the maintenance requirements of drainage systems. Good design requires that these issues be considered and where necessary provision is made to improve the carriageway and drainage condition prior to the introduction of traffic calming features. This may have a significant impact on the overall cost of any traffic calming scheme.

2.4 Consultation requirements

Highway Authorities have a statutory duty to consult the police (Highways Act 1980) when road hump schemes are proposed for a road or area and they must also post notices in the street and in local papers advertising the scheme. The 1999 Highways (Road Hump) Regulations require consultation with the fire service, ambulance service and organisations representing those who use the road.

2.5 20mph speed limits

Research indicates that the speed reduction achieved with the use of 20 mph signs alone is likely to be small, about 1 mph (Mackie, 1998). Therefore, 20 mph speed limits enforced by signs alone would be most appropriate where 85th percentile speeds are already low (24 mph or below) and further traffic calming measures are not needed. 20 mph speed limits without self-enforcing features have the attraction of being relatively inexpensive to implement. However, regard must be given to the prevailing speeds before any intervention, because the higher they are, the less likely it is that speeds could be reduced to 20 mph. Previously the police have written to the Council indicating that they will not support the introduction of 20mph limits without traffic calming where the 85th percentile speed is high. 20 mph speed limits that are not part of a 20 mph zone require terminal signs and repeater signs. The terminal signs should be placed on both sides of the carriageway to form a gateway. Terminal signs should be directly lit or highly reflective.

2.6 20mph zones

20 mph zones should be used where a speed reduction to 20 mph is desirable and where traffic calming measures would be needed to ensure

that speeds are at or below 20 mph (e.g. roads where 85th percentile speeds exceed 24 mph before calming). 20 mph zones are particularly appropriate where there is an existing record of accidents to children occurring over an area, or where concentrations of pedestrians and/or cyclists exist or are anticipated. They can help protect children walking and cycling to and from school, and may help to encourage other children to walk or cycle.

A 20 mph zone should have entry treatments with signing at the gateways to the zone and suitable speed reducing measures. Within the zone speed control measures are needed, which include road humps, raised junctions, speed cushions, horizontal deflections, mini-roundabouts, bends and reductions in the width of the carriageway. The combination and design of measures chosen will depend on the road type, the layout of streets in the area, the level and type of traffic flow and the quality of the streetscape. The speed control capacity of some measures can be much less than that of road humps, and the extensive use of these devices within a 20 mph zone may not result in an acceptable reduction in speed levels. Narrowings will normally need to be 3.5 metres or less to be effective at controlling vehicle speeds. However, this can cause problems for cyclists if a cycle lane bypass is not provided.

A review of the first 230 zones in England, Wales and Scotland (Webster & Mackie, 1996) indicated that average speeds reduced by 9 mph, annual accident frequency fell by 60 percent, the overall reduction in child accidents was 70 percent, and there was an overall reduction in accidents involving cyclists of 29 per cent. Traffic flow in the zones was reduced on average by 27 percent, but flows on the surrounding roads increased by 12 percent. There was generally little measured accident migration to surrounding roads.

2.7 Road humps

Road Humps are the most economically effective means of reducing traffic speeds. In terms of design, they run between the channels of the road covering the running width of the carriageway but allowing drainage channels to operate as normal. In terms of size, the humps are 3.7 m long and are normally 75mm high but can be as high as 100mm.

Road humps are designed to slow all traffic. Consequently, careful consideration has to be given to ensure that the impact of the traffic calming is not overly onerous on emergency services response times and bus timetabling. Both the Ambulance service and bus companies have also expressed concern over the impact that this form of traffic calming has on the comfort of their respective passengers.

In general terms each feature on the highway will cost around £2k to £3k.

2.8 Speed cushions

Speed cushions are a form of vertical deflection designed to slow the speed of general private cars but allowing wider wheel base vehicles to

straddle the feature. Consequently, this type of traffic calming has significantly less impact on the emergency services and bus timetabling.

The features themselves are 1.6m wide and 2.0m long. The height of the feature is set at a maximum of 75mm. The cushions are generally arranged in lane to assist with the smooth flow of traffic.

In general terms a set of speed cushions will cost between £3.5k and £5k.

2.9 Speed plateaus

These features are designed to run from kerb line to kerb line. They are therefore suited to support pedestrian activity, slowing traffic at locations where pedestrians are expected to be crossing the road. The features themselves are effective at slowing all traffic. However, the flat top construction makes them less onerous on bus and ambulance services.

In terms of construction, these are 1.5 m ramps leading to a plateau which is 6m long. The plateau is constructed 75mm above the existing carriageway. Careful consideration needs to be given to road drainage in the vicinity of these features and will often add considerably to the cost of introducing them.

An outline cost for the introduction of a single plateau would be £12k to £15k where drainage works required are limited.

2.10 Narrowings and Chicanes

Horizontal carriageway deflections, such as localised narrowings and chicanes, have been installed to influence vehicle speeds, though not always successfully. In the case of kerb build-outs and pinch points, the narrowed carriageway, even if reduced to a single lane, still allows most vehicles to be driven relatively quickly through the available gap, unless there is opposing traffic to prevent this occurring. Studies have indicated that balanced vehicle flow is one of the most important aspects when opting for localised road narrowings. Unfortunately, in many residential streets traffic is either tidal or such low-flow that it is unlikely that vehicles from opposite directions will meet at the narrowing.

Care also has to be given to ensure that the feature does not cause disadvantage to other road users, in particular cyclists. This may require the introduction of bypass features to allow cyclists to pass the feature without feeling threatened to the closer proximity to vehicles. The creation of such bypasses have to be carefully designed to ensure that they can be maintained and kept free of detritus.

Chicanes and narrowings vary widely in terms of cost. Simple features may cost as little as £1.5k whilst more elaborate chicanes may cost upwards of £10k.

2.11 Driver Feedback Signing

These “driver feedback signs” are traffic calming devices that are proven to give drivers instant feedback as to their speed, thereby encouraging a reduced speed where appropriate without the threat of a speeding conviction. These signs provide an effective visual indication of approaching vehicle’s speed activated by a radar detection system which is coupled to a decoder that illuminates the LED’s (light emitting diodes) with the relative speed. The signage is designed to show the drivers speed in green for those obeying the limit with the speed shown in red for those exceeding it.

Recent studies have shown that these have a modest effect in lowering vehicle speeds.

Costs will vary depending upon local factors, such as the cost of connection to an electricity supply. The cost of purchase and installation of vehicle activated signs can range between £4k and £10k.

2.12 Road Safety Cameras

Safety cameras provide a valuable and cost-effective method of preventing, detecting and enforcing speed and traffic light offences. They encourage changed driver behaviour and are also proven to make a significant contribution to improving road safety for all road users. Safety cameras therefore play an important role in an integrated road safety strategy.

Safety cameras are those that enforce speeding and / or traffic light offences. A number of independent research studies of the National Safety Camera Programme have shown that cameras are an extremely effective mechanism for reducing vehicle speeds and road casualties at camera sites.

An overall study of the effectiveness of cameras has recorded a 42 per cent reduction in death and serious injury and a 22 per cent reduction in personal injury collisions at camera sites.

Welsh Government require that Highway Authorities are able to demonstrate that there is a considerable history of collisions on a section of road, and that consideration of all other engineering options have been exhausted, before a new site will be authorised.

The cost of implementing a camera system is highly variable but will be in excess of £150k.

2.13 Psychological Traffic calming is an approach trialled by the Department for Transport, where reducing driver confidence has proven to reduced vehicle speeds. There are a number of techniques that can be employed from:

- reducing the width of the carriageway to make drivers slow to ensure that they can pass oncoming vehicles without clipping wing mirrors,

- removing positive messaging to motorists, reducing their confidence that they have priority, especially through junction areas, blurring the distinction between 'vehicle areas' and 'pedestrian areas'.
- changing the urban realm from a purely utilitarian highway environment to an area which will make a considerate motorist think that vulnerable road users are likely to be using the highway as well. This can be achieved through planting, the two measures above and public art / other appropriate interventions.

3. Financial implications

There are no financial implications associated with this report.

4. Legal Implications

There are no legal implications associated with this report.

5. Integrated Assessment Implications

5.1 The Council is subject to the Equality Act (Public Sector Equality Duty and the socio-economic duty), the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 and the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure, and must in the exercise of their functions, have due regard to the need to:

- Eliminate unlawful discrimination, harassment and victimisation and other conduct prohibited by the Acts.
- Advance equality of opportunity between people who share a protected characteristic and those who do not.
- Foster good relations between people who share a protected characteristic and those who do not.
- Deliver better outcomes for those people who experience socio-economic disadvantage
- Consider opportunities for people to use the Welsh language
- Treat the Welsh language no less favourably than English.
- Ensure that the needs of the present are met without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs.

5.1.1 The Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2005 mandates that public bodies in Wales must carry out sustainable development. Sustainable development means the process of improving the economic, social, environmental and cultural well-being of Wales by taking action, in accordance with the sustainable development principle, aimed at achieving the 'well-being goals'.

- 5.1.2 Our Integrated Impact Assessment (IIA) process ensures we have paid due regard to the above. It also takes into account other key issues and priorities, such as poverty and social exclusion, community cohesion, carers, the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC) and Welsh language.
- 5.2 As noted, this report is for information only. An IIA assessment will be undertaken to consider the impact on the community and different user groups of any proposed road safety interventions.

Background Papers: None.

Economy, Environment & Infrastructure PDC
Work Plan - 2020 – 2022

Date of Meeting	Report Title	Report Summary	Report Author
15 Jul 2021	Siting of Bus Stops.		Cath Swain
15 Jul 2021	Traffic Calming.	To identify how speed humps affect the community, road surfaces and affect air pollution.	Stuart Davies
16 Sep 2021	Future City Wide Workforce.	We will consider what has changed and what the future plans are for the city and identify good practice and examples of how training and skills can be connected through universities and colleges with business and manufacturing.	Martin Nicholls
21 Oct 2021	Economic Recovery Plan.		Phil Holmes
21 Oct 2021	High Street Regeneration.		Phil Holmes Paul Relf
18 Nov 2021	Grey Fleet Policy.		Stuart Davies Phil John

Page 15

Economy, Environment & Infrastructure PDC
Work Plan - 2020 – 2022

Date of Meeting	Report Title	Report Summary	Report Author
18 Nov 2021	Green Fleet Policy.	Development of an EV Farm. Charging Networks. Investment in Home Charging Kits.	Stuart Davies Phil John
16 Dec 2021	More Homes Housing and De-carbonisation Strategy.	How is the council providing more affordable and energy efficient homes as part of its Housing Revenue Account.	Mark Wade Carol Morgan
16 Dec 2021	Street Lighting Policy.		Stuart Davies Jonathan Hurley Phil John
	Llwybr-Newydd (the new Wales Transport Strategy).		Stuart Davies